



# Roth IRA conversions

## An overview

Thomas H. Duncan, JD, CLU®, ChFC®  
Senior Director, Advanced Consulting Group

---

When the Roth IRA arrived in 1998, there was wide acclaim as to its features: tax-free withdrawals of earnings, tax-deferred growth, and account owners not being subject to required minimum distributions (RMDs); however, its availability was not universal because of the income/filing status limitations to contributing and/or converting.

### THE OPPORTUNITY

Starting in 2010, and continuing beyond, the income/filing status limitations on conversion were removed, making conversion from qualified plans and/or traditional IRAs into Roth IRAs available to all owners of those types of accounts. Beneficiaries of qualified plans may also convert into an inherited Roth IRA. Beneficiaries of traditional IRAs unfortunately may not convert into an inherited Roth IRA.

Please note that the income/filing status limitations on contributions remain in force.

### BENEFITS OF A ROTH IRA – TAXATION OVERVIEW

Understanding the benefits of a Roth conversion comes through a thorough understanding of the tax nature of Roth IRAs.

#### Order of distributions from Roth IRAs

The distributions from Roth IRAs follow the first-in/first-out (FIFO) principle. This means that the flow of distributions from a Roth IRA follows the general order listed below.

1. Contributions
2. Converted amounts
3. Earnings

Each of these different types of dollars has its own rules, but if the rules are understood and followed, their distribution from the Roth IRA may be income tax and premature distribution tax free.

#### Contributions

Contributions to Roth IRAs are withdrawn first and may be withdrawn at anytime without tax consequences, regardless of the owner's age or the age of the Roth IRA account.

## Converted amounts

Converted amounts are withdrawn after contributions and are not subject to income taxation because income tax has already been paid at the time of the conversion. However, withdrawals of converted amounts may be subject to the 10% tax penalty on premature distributions unless the owner is over age 59½ **or** it's been five years since the conversion took place. Each conversion has its own five-year holding period, but distributions of converted amounts come from the oldest conversions first.

## Earnings — general rule

Distributions of earnings come last and may be income tax free if the account owner is over age 59½ **and** it has been five years since the first contribution or conversion into a Roth IRA. If a withdrawal of earnings takes place when the owner is under age 59½, it may also be subject to the 10% tax on premature distributions as well as income taxation unless one of the following exceptions applies.

## Earnings — premature withdrawal exceptions

If the owner is under age 59½ when a withdrawal of earnings occurs, that withdrawal may be income and premature distribution tax free as long as it's been five years since the first contribution or conversion into a Roth IRA, **and** the distribution is due to the owner becoming disabled or is made for first-time homebuyer expenses (limited to a \$10,000 lifetime maximum). Alternatively, income taxation is not avoided if it has not been over five years from the first funding of the Roth IRA, but the tax for premature distributions is avoided for both disability and first-time homebuyer situations regardless of Roth IRA account age.

For distributions of earnings under age 59½, the premature distribution tax may also be avoided, but not income taxation, if the distribution is any of the following:

- Part of a series of substantially equal periodic payments over life or life expectancy, commonly referred to as 72(t)
- Made for medical expenses that exceed the allowable amount of AGI for that tax year
- Made to an unemployed individual after separation from employment for health insurance premiums if the individual has received federal or state unemployment compensation
- Used to pay for qualified education expenses for the owner or the owner's spouse or any child or grandchild of either
- Made on account of an IRS levy under Code section 6331 on the Roth IRA

## TAX DEFERRAL

The amounts invested in a Roth IRA enjoy tax-deferred growth.

## NO RMDs BY THE OWNER

Roth IRA owners are not required to take required minimum distributions (RMDs).

## BENEFICIARIES

*Spousal beneficiaries* of Roth IRAs may re-register the Roth IRA into their own name and continue the Roth IRA on as their own without being forced to take distributions.

*Nonspouse beneficiaries* of Roth IRAs are subject to RMDs. However, no 10% tax on premature distributions will apply to any distribution — required or discretionary — from an inherited Roth IRA, and distributions of earnings to the beneficiary may be income tax free if it has been over five years from the owner's first funding of the Roth IRA. Beneficiaries also enjoy the same distributional ordering rules as owners — contributions, converted amounts, earnings. The beneficiary has until December 31 of the tenth year following the year of the owner's death to liquidate the inherited Roth IRA, unless an eligible designated beneficiary exception applies permitting life expectancy based payouts.

## IMPACT ON SOCIAL SECURITY

Tax-free Roth IRA distributions will not increase the likelihood that Social Security benefits could be subject to income taxation. In contrast, distributions from traditional IRAs, because they are usually taxable, may raise total taxable income to a level that subjects Social Security benefits to income taxation.

## EVALUATION CRITERIA

Evaluating the Roth conversion opportunity and taxation benefits of a Roth IRA are the first and second steps in the process. Next, clients have several threshold questions they need to consider to determine if a Roth conversion makes sense for them. Implicit in this determination is also an understanding by the owner of the reason for converting — either for retirement income

or estate planning purposes or perhaps both. Determining the reason for the conversion (retirement income and/or estate planning) can help the client evaluate the trade-offs that are an inherent part of Roth conversion decision-making.

### **THRESHOLD QUESTION ONE: FUTURE INCOME TAX RATES**

The first evaluation point is the client's belief in where their (or their beneficiaries') personal income tax rate will be in retirement relative to where it will be in the year of conversion. If the client believes the income tax rate will be higher in retirement than it is now, conversion may make some sense. If the income tax rate will be lower in retirement than it is now, then conversion may not make sense. If the income tax rate will be the same, then from an income tax perspective, conversion is neutral. However, in a tax-neutral situation, not being forced to take RMDs or that beneficiaries may receive income tax-free distributions could outweigh the concern about the owner's current income taxation situation as an evaluation point.

### **THRESHOLD QUESTION TWO: PAYING THE CONVERSION TAX**

The second evaluation point is determining where the money will come from that will be used to pay the taxes due on the conversion. If the client must access the converted amount to pay the taxes due on the conversion, then conversion may not make sense because of the loss of the beneficial compounding effect of keeping the total converted amount together. In addition, if the client is under age 59½ when the conversion occurs and they take a distribution from the IRA to pay the taxes due on the conversion, then the 10% tax on premature distributions would apply to the distribution.

### **THRESHOLD QUESTION THREE: HOLDING PERIOD BEFORE DISTRIBUTIONS**

The third evaluation point is how quickly the client will need to access the converted amount for retirement income. Five years is a minimum appropriate holding period because of the two five-year taxation-driven holding periods, mentioned above, that must be considered when evaluating a Roth conversion.

Essentially, if the client is under age 59½ and needs to take a withdrawal from the converted Roth account within five years of the conversion, then conversion may not make sense because of the potential negative tax effects.

Beyond the five-year holding periods imposed by the Roth taxation rules itself, there is also the effect of compounding to consider. This effect may dictate that a holding period of seven to ten years or longer may be appropriate to allow the Roth IRA to have enough time to grow to make back the taxes paid on the conversion.

### **ROTH RECHARACTERIZATIONS**

The ability to undertake a recharacterization of a Roth conversion has been eliminated by the Tax Cuts and Jobs Act tax reform legislation passed in late 2017.

### **PRO-RATA RULE — ALLOCATING AFTER-TAX CONTRIBUTIONS TO A CONVERSION**

The pro-rata principle is designed to proportionally allocate any after-tax, nondeductible contributions inside traditional IRAs to the amount converted to a Roth IRA. The purpose of this rule is to prevent cherry-picking of accounts for conversion that are primarily composed of after-tax contributions in an attempt to reduce the amount of income tax on a conversion. The self-reporting Form 8606 is used to determine the amount of any after-tax contributions to traditional IRAs.

If you have more than one traditional IRA account and any of those accounts contain after-tax contributions, the pro-rata rule is designed to prevent you from selecting that account alone for conversion in order to reduce the income tax owed.

The pro-rata rule requires you to look at all traditional IRAs, including SEP and SIMPLE IRAs, together and find the after-tax/pretax ratio of all traditional IRAs. Then you multiply the amount being converted by the after-tax percentage to find the nontaxable amount of the conversion. Finally, you subtract the nontaxable amount of the conversion from the total conversion amount to find the taxable portion of the conversion.

Let's consider the following hypothetical example:

The client has three traditional IRAs. The accounts have a mix of after-tax contributions and pretax contributions and earnings. Initially the client is interested in converting only account #2 because it contains the least amount of pretax dollars; thus, it looks like converting that account would reduce the taxable amount of the conversion to the \$5,000 of pretax earnings.

Traditional IRA	After-tax contributions	Pretax (deductible) contributions	Pretax earnings	IRA values
#1	\$0	\$35,000	\$40,000	\$75,000
#2	\$20,000	\$0	\$5,000	\$25,000
#3	\$30,000	\$40,000	\$30,000	\$100,000
Totals	\$50,000	\$75,000	\$75,000	\$200,000

Instead, the pro-rata rule requires that the client must first add the balance in all their IRAs together — in this case, \$200,000. Second, they must find the total amount of after-tax contributions in their IRAs using form 8606 — here \$50,000. Then they divide the total after-tax nondeductible contributions by the total balance; here, it's \$50,000 divided by \$200,000. This gives you the percentage — 25%, in our example — of any conversion that's tax-free. The client then multiplies the converted amount by the after-tax percentage to yield the nontaxable amount of the conversion: \$25,000 x .25 = \$6,250. Then you subtract the nontaxable amount of the conversion from the total converted amount to get the taxable amount of this conversion: \$25,000 - \$6,250 = \$18,750. Thus, \$18,750 of account #2 is the taxable amount of this conversion — not the \$5,000 as initially thought.

The pro-rata rule can actually be a positive for the client because it may lower the amount of the taxable amount of any conversion because it proportionally applies after-tax contributions to any conversion amount. It can also be a positive for an advisor because it can serve as a means to help the advisor uncover the client's traditional IRA assets that are not already under management.

### CONVERSION WRAP-UP

The unlimited conversion privilege makes Roth IRAs available to many more people than ever before. The tax-free nature of distributions from Roth IRAs may make generating and keeping retirement income easier. It may also make the Roth conversion a positive wealth transfer tool for clients.

Be careful to consider the pro-rata rule when undertaking a Roth conversion.

Ultimately, the decision to undertake a conversion should be done in conjunction with the client's tax advisor, but some evaluation points they'll want to consider are the likelihood of increases in income tax rates in the future, where the money is going to come from to pay the taxes and how long before they will need access to the Roth IRA dollars.

### CONCLUSION

The Roth IRA conversion opportunity may be a way for your clients with traditional IRA or qualified plan rollover assets to take advantage of the Roth IRA's tax-free income privileges.



This material is not a recommendation to buy or sell a financial product or to adopt an investment strategy. Investors should discuss their specific situation with their financial professional.

Federal income tax laws are complex and subject to change. The information in this memorandum is based on current interpretations of the law and is not guaranteed. Neither Nationwide, nor its employees, its agents, brokers or registered representatives give legal or tax advice.

Nationwide, the Nationwide N and Eagle and Nationwide is on your side are service marks of Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company.  
© 2021 Nationwide

NFM-6420AO.12 (02/22)